TO: Mayor and Members of Council

Manager – Infrastructure and Transportation
Engineering and Transportation Division

DATE: May 16, 2013

SUBJECT: Tender Award: Contract T13-156
Rehabilitation of Dresden Bridge – St. George Street over
Sydenham River
Community of Dresden, Municipality of Chatham-Kent

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that:

1. The tender in the amount of $239,063.81 (plus HST) for the work associated with
Contract T13-156 Rehabilitation of Dresden Bridge – St. George Street over
Sydenham River - Community of Dresden, Municipality of Chatham-Kent be
awarded to Elmara Construction of Windsor, Ontario.

BACKGROUND

This contract consists of the rehabilitation of the Dresden Bridge on St George Street
over the Sydenham River (TMS 47164687N17403238E) in the Community of Dresden. As illustrated in Figure 1, the structure is a three-span, cast-in-place concrete structure with a total length of fifty-six (56) metres. The bridge was originally constructed in 1933 and is located on a main arterial road in the Community of Dresden. This location serves as one of the discrete crossing points over the Sydenham River. Reference Figure 2.

Bi-annual inspections have been conducted by the Municipality of Chatham-Kent (as legislated under the Public Transportation and Highway Improvement Act) to continually monitor the condition of the structures and to ensure public safety. As of the last legislated inspection, the subject structure was documented as being in excellent condition with an index of 95. Major concerns noted were:

- severe delamination of the deck concrete
- wide cracking on the south frame leg
- severe deterioration of drains condition with water and salt presently discharging onto deck and substructure
In early 2012, a Request for Proposals was released by Engineering and Transportation Division. Several proposals were received and reviewed. Dillon Consulting was identified as the preferred consultant and the assignment was approved by Chatham-Kent Council.
COMMENTS

The rehabilitative efforts found in this contract include concrete repairs to deck, soffit, abutments and piers as well as sealing of exposed concrete surfaces and parapet walls.

The project was let for competitive public tender in April of 2013.

The Purchasing Officer received and opened tenders for the work on April 25, 2013. The tender results are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Bidder and Location</th>
<th>Tender Amount (plus HST)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Elmara Construction – Windsor, Ontario</td>
<td>$239,063.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Jarlian Construction Incorporated -</td>
<td>$284,970.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Carlington Construction Incorporated -</td>
<td>$342,250.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Clarke Construction – Blenheim, Ontario</td>
<td>$406,194.71*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Intrepid General Limited – Chatham, Ontario</td>
<td>$432,500.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Facca Construction – Ruscom, Ontario</td>
<td>$450,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Front Construction – Windsor, Ontario</td>
<td>$489,821.65*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note A: A mathematical error was corrected which did not influence the rank of the bids received.

Note B: The consultant’s estimate of the value of the contract, developed prior to tendering, was $350,000 + HST.

Note C: Average of bids submitted = $377,829

Dillon Consulting has reviewed the tenders and note that they are complete in all respects. Dillon Consulting has recommended that the project be awarded to the low bidder, Elmara Construction of Windsor, with a bid of $239,063.81 + HST. Total project costs of $298,397.78 are approximately 1% below the $300,000 estimate identified by the lifecycle budget.

Per the terms of the tender, work may commence any time after July 2, 2013 with total completion required by August 2, 2013.

Due to the importance of this bridge structure in the transportation network, and given that much of the scope of work entails work beneath the bridge deck, traffic will be maintained across the structure for the duration of the contract. During such times as when the contractor is working on the deck of the structure, temporary traffic controls will be put in place and traffic will be restricted to one single lane.
COUNCIL STRATEGIC DIRECTIONS

The recommendation in this report supports the following Council Directions:

- Healthy, Active Citizens
- Growth Through Variety of Post-Secondary Institutions
- High Quality Environment Through Innovation
- Destination Chatham-Kent!
- Magnet for Sustainable Growth
- Prosperous and Thriving Community
- Has the potential to support all Council Directions
- Neutral issues (does not support negatively or positively)

CONSULTATION

No consultations were held specifically related to the preparation of this report.

Engineering and Transportation Division conducted a Public Information Centre on February 12, 2013 in the Community of Dresden. Residents, business owners and others interested in the project were welcome to attend, review the scope of work and make comments regarding same.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Project fees (consultant fees, costs of construction, etc.) associated with this contract will be funded as summarized in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Implications</th>
<th>Contract T13-156 Rehabilitation of Dresden Bridge on St. George Street over Sydenham River</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A) Project Costs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended Tender</td>
<td>$239,063.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended Contingency Allowance</td>
<td>$10,000.00**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering – Design, Tender and Specifications</td>
<td>$30,023.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering – Material Testing</td>
<td>$10,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering – Conservation Authority Application Fee</td>
<td>$150.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering – Hydradeck platform rental</td>
<td>$4,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plus HST 13.00%</td>
<td>$38,120.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less HST Rebate 11.24%</td>
<td>$32,959.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Current Project Costs</td>
<td>$298,397.78*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Current Project Funding</td>
<td>$298,397.78*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note A: Contingency allowance may or may not be expended and is recommended to address any unforeseen issues which present during the course of the project and are not covered by the contract specifications.

Note B: This allowance is being carried to cover costs associated with material testing and quality control and may or may not be expended to its full value.

Note C: Total project costs of $298,397.78 are approximately 1% below the lifecycle budget estimate of $300,000.
Prepared by:  Reviewed by:

________________________________________________________________________

Manager, Infrastructure and Transportation  Director
Engineering and Transportation Division  Engineering and Transportation Division
Infrastructure and Engineering Services  Infrastructure and Engineering Services

Reviewed by:

________________________________________________________________________

Thomas Kelly, P. Eng., MBA
General Manager
Infrastructure and Engineering Services

Attachments:  Appendix A  Letter of Recommendation – Dillon Consulting

(c. General Manager – Infrastructure and Engineering Services
   Director – Engineering and Transportation Division
   Director – Public Works Division

(RTC:\Infrastructure & Engineering\I&ES\2013\3558 – Tender Award Contract T13-156
Rehabilitation of Dresden Bridge.doc)
April 26, 2013

Corporation of the
Municipality of Chatham-Kent
P.O. Box 640
Chatham, ON
N7M 5K8

Attention: Mr. Stephen Jahns, B.A.Sc., P.Eng., CMMIII
Manager, Infrastructure and Transportation
Engineering and Transportation Division
Infrastructure and Engineering Services Department

Dresden Bridge – St. George Street over Sydenham River
Bridge Rehabilitation
BRIDGE ID: 4716468N17403238E
Community of Dresden
Contract No. T13-156
Tender Comparison

Dear Sir:

We have reviewed the seven (7) tenders received for the above captioned project. We have noted three (3) mathematical errors associated the bids submitted by Clarke Construction, Front Construction and Elmara Construction. These errors resulted in changes to the final bid as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contractor</th>
<th>Total Contract Price (recorded)</th>
<th>Corrected Total Contract Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elmara Construction</td>
<td>$239,063.00</td>
<td>$239,063.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jarlian Construction Inc</td>
<td>$284,970.00</td>
<td>* N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlington Construction Inc</td>
<td>$342,250.00</td>
<td>* N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarke Construction</td>
<td>$406,194.69</td>
<td>$406,194.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrepid General</td>
<td>$432,500.00</td>
<td>* N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facca Inc</td>
<td>$450,000.00</td>
<td>* N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Front Construction</td>
<td>$489,823.01</td>
<td>$489,821.65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* N/A denotes no mathematical errors were noted.

The above prices exclude all taxes. These errors did not affect the bid results.

The low tender, amounting to Two hundred and thirty-nine thousand and sixty-three dollars and eighty-one cents ($239,063.81) was received from Elmara Construction. Our engineers estimate is $310,000.00. The low tender received is 23% below the Engineer's estimate and 37% below the average of the seven (7) tenders received.
We are satisfied that Elmara Construction has the required equipment and labour expertise to undertake this project. We would therefore recommend that the Corporation of the Municipality of Chatham-Kent consider awarding the above noted project to Elmara Construction.

If you have any further questions or comments, please contact our office.

Yours sincerely,

DILLON CONSULTING LIMITED

Thomas Debevec, P.Eng.
Project Manager

TLD:sll

Our File: 12-6460